

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA**

EMILE AUGUSTE AND MAVIS  
MURPHY, individuals,

Plaintiffs,

v.

BMW OF NORTH AMERICA, LLC, a  
Delaware Limited Liability Company;  
and DOES 1 through 10, inclusive,

Defendants.

Case No.: 2:17-cv-6194-RSWL (PLAx)

**JUDGMENT**

Judge: Hon. Ronald S. W. Lew  
Courtroom: 6C

Action Filed: July 11, 2017  
Trial Date: March 19, 2019

This action came on regularly for trial on March 19, 2019, in Courtroom 6C of the United States District Court, Central District of California, the Honorable Ronald S.W. Lew presiding. Plaintiffs Emile Auguste and Mavis Murphy were represented at trial by Laura E. Goolsby and Stephanie S. Pengilley. Defendant BMW of North America, LLC was represented at trial by Mark G. Arnzen, Jr. and Monica Y. Hernandez.

A jury of seven (7) persons was regularly impaneled and sworn. Witnesses were sworn and testified. At the close of evidence, the Court granted Defendant BMW of North America, LLC's motions for judgment as a matter of law on Plaintiffs' implied warranty and civil penalty claims. After hearing the evidence and argument of counsel,

the jury was duly instructed by the Court and the case was submitted to the jury with directions to return a verdict on Plaintiffs' express warranty claim. The jury deliberated and thereafter returned to the Court its verdict as follows:

1. As to the Song-Beverly Consumer Warranty Act § 1793.2 for breach of express warranty, we, the jury in the above-captioned case, unanimously find for:

Plaintiffs

Defendant X

*If your response to Question 1 is for Plaintiffs, please answer Question 2. If your response is for Defendant, do not answer Question 2.*

2. We, the jury in the above-captioned, unanimously award damages to Plaintiffs in the amount of \_\_\_\_\_.

DATED: March 22, 2019

SIGNED: /s/  
Presiding Juror

**IT IS HEREBY ORDERED, ADJUDGED AND DECREED** that Judgment is granted and shall be entered in favor of Defendant BMW of North America, LLC on all of the claims asserted against it by Plaintiffs Emile Auguste and Mavis Murphy.

DATED: 3/27/2019

s/ RONALD S.W. LEW  
Honorable Ronald S. W. Lew